EDCI 67200 Reflection of Developing Expertise

Alicia King

Purdue University

Problem Finding

1. *Summarize vs. Synthesize*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Case** | **Quotes** | **Evidence** |
| Michael Bishop | “It will take an administrator who is willing to explore methods of engagement to accept this pilot test. However, disrupting curriculum maps and making time for one more program can be frustrating for educators. I have experienced it first-hand. The presentation of this pilot test will need to be well thought out.” | In my Michael Bishop case, I’m starting to synthesize the situation with my own knowledge. I have taken the situation and I have illustrated how frustrating this process can be for teachers. I begin to look at the situation from an IDer’s perspective now.  I believe this demonstrated my growth towards expertise. |
| Lynn Dixon | “The graphics that Ben has discussed in the case study appear to be decorative graphics. Per Sung and Mayer’s study, these graphics, such as the bird, have little impact on learning. Should Lynn choose to steer away from adding these fancy graphics, I don’t think the integrity of the kiosk will be impacted. The kiosk will still have nice designs and be eye catching, but the added graphics will not impact the learning like Ben is hoping.” | By the Lynn Dixon case I’m starting to realize the multiple sources and ideas I can connect. This connection was evident in the Lynn Dixon case. I took information from an article I read previously and used it to defend my reasoning about the graphics. I believe this was a clear step towards synthesis. |
| Abby Carlin | “In the article “Finding Training Techniques that Bridge Generation Gaps”, Geise (2012) mentions some of the generational gaps that exist in the workplace. I think Abby can easily incorporate some of these strategies in her situation. She needs to utilize the strength of each generation. The retiring employees need to share their “war stories” with the new hires, because they like to feel like they are helping others and the younger generation needs to hear what can go wrong.” | Once again in the Abby Carlin case I feel that I have effectively used an article to start synthesizing knowledge that I had gained to help make sense of the issues I came across in this case study. It went deeper than just summarizing the issue in which she needs to gain information from the retiring SMEs. This article helped them explain what a benefit it would be for the retiring employees to share their experiences. It would not only help Abby but also be a positive experience for the members of this generation. |
| Jack Waterkamp | “In the article, “Parallels Between Project Management and Instructional Design” by Jacqueline Layng (1997), we are introduced to four phases of a project. These phases are listed as conceptualization, planning, execution and termination. Jack has completed the first two phases beautifully, however, he has experienced disconnect in the execution phase. In this phase a project manager should be working on developing the different pieces of a project. The article suggest that all steps of the process rely on how well the project manager can communicate with the entire team. Jack's team understood their role, but not all members embraced or acted on the responsibility that came with their role.” | I believe in the Jack Waterkamp case study I have demonstrated my synthesizing skills the best. I could take information that I had gathered and used it to diagnose the case study as well as create solutions. I have completely moved out of summary into how this information can frame the problem at hand. As I looked back through my case study of Waterkamp I couldn’t find a more appropriate demonstration than this. In many of the dimensions I feel that I waiver back and forth from expertise to novice. However, in this dimension, I feel that I grew over time. |

1. *Principles vs. Features*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Case** | **Quotes** | **Evidence** |
| Michael Bishop | “Secondly, because he cannot implement the game due to lack of interest, there must be a problem with the “Design” step of the ADDIE model matching the needs of the client. However, due to complications, Michael is still trying to determine what design flaw is keeping him from the implementation stage.” | I feel in this Michael Bishop case I did not do a great job of finding principles but restating features. In the quote used below I start to expand on the features, but I feel that I never accomplished what I wanted to. I should have expanded more into the challenges of the case and into the bigger concept of introducing any new curriculum into a school district and the challenges experienced. |
| Lynn Dixon | “In this meeting [of] time constraints, budget restrictions and content amount need to be addressed. The longer this goes undealt with, the more likely they will have an upset customer and cite lack of communication of expectations. Because the client has had little experience with this kind of work, the more communication the better.” | In my Lynn Dixon case I believe I started to move past information. The principle of communication is referenced in this quote. Working with your team is a major part of any project. Lynn needs to meet the needs of the stakeholders. To make this growing project work, Lynn must communicate with the client to determine what can be done. |
| Abby Carlin | “She knows her goal, but does not have the information from the SME to complete this stage in its entirety.  Without proper knowledge about what current employees are doing, she cannot formulate what should be shared for future employees.” | In the Abby Carlin case, you can see that ID expertise is currently being exercised. I could take facts from the case and expand principles such as the difficulty that is created without proper access to a SME. It creates a whole new list of challenges for the IDer. |
| Jack Waterkamp | “Jack’s priority and his main challenge is to manage the project better.  Learning to manage people and deadlines can be tricky. However, no forward movement can happen if miscommunication and disconnects are still happening.” | I believe that in my Jack Waterkamp case I could move past the concrete items and focus on principles regarding the facts presented. I believe that my developing expertise is very evident. |

1. *Relationships among Issues*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Case** | **Quotes** | **Evidence** |
| Michael Bishop | “Once the pilot test is accepted, Michael can then work with a consistent group of stakeholder and adjust the game as necessary based on the clients and audience needs.” | In this case I connected the issues effectively. I developed a strong scope of the issues and then processed them throughout the rest of the case study developing solutions for the issues connected towards the beginning of the case. |
| Lynn Dixon | “Lynn is being asked to do too much in a short amount of time. The client also has never worked on this kind of project and is making requests and suggestions that do not fit into their budget. This is creating a project that is continually adding new content without much thought of the impact it will have on the overall project.” | I also feel very confident about my ability to connect the issues within this case study as well. I was even able to pinpoint the biggest issue for Lynn. Due to these factors, the issues all connected have created a constantly growing amount of content making it very hard for Lynn to decide what is useful and what is not. |
| Abby Carlin | “She will need to first start by completing the “Analysis” stage. This means that she will need to find a way to interact with the retiring employees. They are the only ones with knowledge regarding how to operate the 60-year-old machine. Due to the rapid changes in technology, there is probably not a lot of existing information anymore that is easily attainable for the machines.” | This was my weakest in my opinion. I was not able to point out the relationship among all the issues but to only expand on the issues. I believe in this case study I had standalone issues and created solutions for each of these independent of the other. I believe I tied my solutions together much better than my issues. It would have been better to connect the 60-year old machines and retiring employees with how that will require unique training approaches. |
| Jack Waterkamp | “Next, he needs to figure out the current scope of his project and address any flaws to their current timeline. Right away he needs to address the “Development” stage of ADDIE. I would argue that he needs to be able to manage his team and project a bit better before [redirecting Lewis’ team to begin] developing or fixing any more of the software. I think the scope of the project can then be reassessed for concrete ideas on how to move forward and how to address any issues in a planned and organized way.” | I redeemed myself with the Jack Waterkamp case. I pulled together the issues and processed them as a unit. They all seemed to stem back from the lack of project management. From the miscommunications, to the GANTT chart and to the approaching deadline. I felt I packaged all of the solutions together to determine the underlying issue of weak project management. |

1. *Reflective Vs. Reflexive*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Case** | **Quotes** | **Evidence** |
| Michael Bishop | “A suggestion Michael could use to make a better connection with his clients would be to create a sample curriculum that incorporates the game. This curriculum could even portray a type of blended learning situation. This would give school districts a bigger picture of how it could work in the classroom and enhance learning while meeting the objectives being taught in the classroom.” | I did not expand as much as I should have on the Michael Bishop case. I stated the information that was given but did not link a hypothesis to my issues as well as I should have. However, in this quote I start to think of possible outcomes that could arise by suggesting a solution. I’m starting to move past the laundry list of ideas that is referenced my Ertmer and Stepich (2005). In most of my cases I don’t think I was as reflexive as I could have been. |
| Lynn Dixon | “This is creating a setback in the design process for Lynn by adding more information. By eliminating this portion, it will allow for time to be saved that would have been spent on researching, planning and writing that element. With this element gone the design of the kiosk will not have to be so crammed or intense.” | In this case study, I take information and create a possible scenario that is presented by the issue. I combat this thinking with a possible solution. Expertise is demonstrated by the moving past of simple information delivered by the case study. I have delivered a testable hypothesis with the stated solution. |
| Abby Carlin | “I think Abby should use creative tools such as Gopros, pictures and interviews to collect data from the current employees, but especially the retiring employees. These personal stories and information about these machines from the veterans will be more meaningful and genuine as new employees begin to learn the machine.” | I think one of my weakest examples of this section would be my Abby Carlin case. However, here I have started to hypothesize a scenario that could form from conducting these interviews. We move past the information and decide what would become of this solution. I mention the stories to be meaningful and genuine training approaches. |
| Jack Waterkamp | “Development seems to be the biggest Instructional Design challenge that Jack will face. We are introduced to Jack in the middle of a large scope change. He needs to develop a web-based training as well as to continue developing the classroom-based training. There are many stakeholders in this process which makes this project even more vital to ensure unity in all parts.” | The Jack Waterkamp case illustrates my reflexive approach which would include going beyond just facts and problems in the case studies. There are signs of forward thinking and problem solving. However, to truly be reflexive there needs to be evidence of a hypothesis or a possible scenario. Determining what could possibly happen. I believe I slipped back to more of a novice thinking while evaluating this case study. |

Problem Solving

1. *Relationships Among Solutions*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Case** | **Quotes** | **Evidence** |
| Michael Bishop | “He should create a sample curriculum that will offer even more structure for the teachers and administrators past the initial teacher training. This will demonstrate the designer’s willingness to work with the expectations already laid by the corporation to stay focused on standardized testing and growth.” | I believe this case could have had even more connections than stated. A connection between a solution and outcome is made. This demonstrates the relationship that is forming but does not connect proposed solutions in a genuine way. |
| Lynn Dixon | “Lynn needs to ask Ben to let go of the idea of including information regarding the aborigines in the kiosk. This is creating a setback in the design process for Lynn by adding more information. By eliminating this portion, it will allow for time to be saved that would have been spent on researching, planning and writing that element.” | This was not a reasonable solution at all. However, this would have been a great opportunity to tie solutions together. As you can see I began to connect the proposed solutions together and form different relationships. However, A better solution would have been to discuss the scope and accommodated for as many of Ben’s proposals as possible instead taking out items. |
| Abby Carlin | “My final recommendation would be to partner with Andrew Thomas and create some incentives to motivate “Big Jon” and other retiring employees to spend some time helping the designer and client get information about the machine. This will be the most time efficient and budget friendly option for FDM and Abby.” | Here I think I tied together the solution with the issue identified. I explicitly mention how this solution will be beneficial for the timeline and the budget of the project effectively making that connection. Multiple things are considered in this excerpt from the case study. |
| Jack Waterkamp | “Even though this is Jack’s project, he needs to utilize his team for help if it is necessary. Overall, he needs to better hold his team accountable for their portion of the project. This is where some disconnect happened in the project management the first time.” | Two solutions proposed here “utilizing his team” and “holding them accountable” are all referencing to the disconnect of the team. This quote demonstrates the relationship between the two effortlessly. The bigger picture is being is being noticed. |

*B. Consideration of Implications*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Case** | **Quotes** | **Evidence** |
| Michael Bishop | “Variety in options may heighten the interest of administrators. Also, shows willingness to adapt to pre-existing instructional pieces such as curriculum maps.” | I did not consider the implications very well in my Michael Bishop case. I should have referenced more within this section the implications of writing several curriculum options. |
| Lynn Dixon | “The discouragement will exist from Ben and Laura, but the importance of an on-time and within-budget kiosk is the more important than the [Content] cuts they will make.” | In this area I was able to show growth towards expertise. I tried to justify and consider cons as best I could to defend my solution and to demonstrate my understanding of the specific case. |
| Abby Carlin | “The last con that might arise from this solution would include the cameras possibly missing important details. I believe this is where incentivized partnering with the retirees will be beneficial. They could help fill gaps or even re-film as needed.” | I think this is another strong demonstration of the understanding of implications. I have considered the outcomes and have even taken it a step farther to ensure the solution reflects how to navigate the observed implications. |
| Jack Waterkamp | “The first solution will keep the project’s integrity intact as much as possible.  However, due to a lack of time, the quality may suffer more than originally planned, but not to the extreme that the project would have endured in solution two.” | I think this is also a strong example. When considering the solution, negative implications are considered. However, quickly a more positive thought process was shown immediately justifying these implications. |

*C. Rigid vs. Flexible*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Case** | **Quotes** | **Evidence** |
| Michael Bishop | “Various uses of the curriculum can make different clients interested thanks to this addition. With many approaches, hopefully an administrator will be willing to try it in a setting that is not after school or in a gifted class, but in a general education classroom.” | An expert allows for solutions to change as more information becomes available. As shown here there is uncertainty and it shows an acceptance that this might not be the final solution, but a decision based on what is known is displayed. |
| Lynn Dixon | “The audience may not get the information that they were hoping for depending on their background and demographic.” | In this case, it is hard to do a complete analysis of the crowds coming to the display. However, the designers need to be able to appeal to as many demographics as possible. This is demonstration of flexibility. I think it could have been worded differently, but my initial thought process can be found in the quote. |
| Abby Carlin | “The last con that might arise from this solution would include the cameras possibly missing important details. I believe this is where incentivized partnering with the retirees will be beneficial. They could help fill gaps or even re-film as needed.” | In this quote the designer is very flexible in finding solutions if the problem is not solved immediately. This is the most evident form of flexibility in my opinion. The IDer has come up with another plan to meet the needs of the stakeholders |
| Jack Waterkamp | “The first solution will keep the project’s integrity intact as much as possible.  However, due to a lack of time, the quality **may** suffer more than originally planned, but not to the extreme that the project would have endured in solution two.” | I believe that this is my weakest form of flexibility. There was a sense of multiple pathways and choosing of the better path. However, my solutions did not have as much overall openness to change in solution once initiated. |

Overall Rating

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Case** | **Rating** |
| Michael Bishop | Medium- Problem identification weak, solutions were reasonable |
| Lynn Dixon | Low- ID Problems identified, but solutions were unreasonable. |
| Abby Carlin | Medium- ID problem not completely identified, One solution unreasonable |
| Jack Waterkamp | Medium- ID problems Identified but lacking in one solution |

Action Plan for Moving Forward

As stated above, I have identified some obvious weaknesses. I have clear areas such as flexibility and synthesizing that have been a challenge for me. I also am a bit too reflective in my problem finding. I need to be able to pull the most important parts of a case together and hypothesize an outcome. However, I think that I have grown tremendously on the pathway to becoming an expert. I have learned to respect my constraints and have identified relationships among issues and solutions well. Throughout my case studies I have demonstrated that I can consider the implications of my solutions more and more. I am very pleased with how I met these challenges.   
 Like many things in life, my action plan moving forward will include practicing these items more. The more I have a chance to sharpen these skills I must try. If I do not give myself the opportunity to apply my growing skills, I may lose them. Experts are formed by knowledge and application of that knowledge. I need to keep applying myself in these realms. One area that I seem to have struggled the most is with posing solutions. At first I was not respecting the non-negotiables such as budget and time. I also tended to think outside of the focus of an instructional designer. Understanding this weakness has been the most powerful concept that I have learned over the past few weeks. Tuning my problem-solving skills and building experience in this area is where I will give most of my attention.

Resources:

Ertmer, P.A., Quinn, J. A., & Glazewski, K.D. (2012). The ID CaseBook: Case Studies in Instructional Design. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Education, Inc.

Ertmer, P. A., & Stepich, D. (2005, November-December). Instructional design expertise: how will we know it when we see it? *Educational Technology*, 38-43.

Geise, T. (2012, April). Finding Training Techniques that Bridge Generation Gaps. New Equipment Digest.

King, A. M. (2017). *Abby Carlin Case Analysis.* (Unpublished Paper). Purdue University, West Lafayette, Indiana.

King, A. M. (2017). *Jack Waterkamp Case Analysis.* (Unpublished Paper). Purdue University, West Lafayette, Indiana.

King, A. M. (2017). *Lynn Dixon Case Analysis.* (Unpublished Paper). Purdue University, West Lafayette, Indiana.

King, A. M. (2017). *Michael Bishop Case Analysis.* (Unpublished Paper). Purdue University, West Lafayette, Indiana.

Layng, J. (1997). Parallels between project management and instructional design. Performance Improvement, 36(6), 16-20.

Sung, E., & Mayer, R. E. (2012). When graphics improve liking but not learning from online lessons. *Computers in Human Behavior,28*(5), 1618-1625.